Honorable Jamal N. Whitehead

2

1

3

5

8

9

7

10

11

12

13

1415

16 17

18

19

2021

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

MCPHAIL DECLARATION IN OPPOSITION TO VALVE CORPORATION'S

LLC; and Patent Asset Management, LLC.

MOTION TO COMPEL

Case No. 2:23-cv-01016 Page 1 of 4

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON AT SEATTLE

VALVE CORPORTION,		
Plaintiff, v.	DECLARATION OF DONALD MCPHAIL IN OPPOSITION TO VALVE CORPORATION'S MOTION TO COMPEL	
LEIGH ROTHSCHILD, ROTHSCHILD		
) NOTE ON MOTION CALENDAD.	
BROADCAST DISTRIBUTION	NOTE ON MOTION CALENDAR:	
SYSTEMS, LLC, DISPLAY	March 28, 2025	
TECHNOLOGIES, LLC, PATENT ASSET		
MANAGEMENT, LLC, MEYLER LEGAL	Complaint filed: July 7, 2023	
PLLC, AND SAMUEL MEYLER)	
Defendants.) Case No.: 2:23-cv-01016	
·		

- I, Donald McPhail, declare as follows:
- 1. I am attorney with Merchant & Gould P.C., and I am one of the attorneys of record for Defendants Leigh Rothschild; Rothschild Broadcast Distribution Systems, LLC; Display Technologies, LLC; Patent Asset Management, LLC; Meyler Legal PLLC; and Samuel Meyler (collectively, the "Defendants"). I make this declaration on my own information, knowledge, and belief, based on a reasonable investigation, in support of, the Rothschild Defendants' Opposition to Valve Corporation's Motion to Compel.¹
- 2. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 26** is a true and correct copy of an email chain between counsel for Defendants to counsel for Valve Corporation, with a date range of October 16, 2024 through November 26, 2024.

¹ The Rothschild Defendants refers to a subset of the Defendants and includes Defendants Leigh Rothschild; Rothschild Broadcast Distribution Systems, LLC; Display Technologies,

3. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 27** is a true and correct copy of an email chain

DC LAW GROUP

12055 15th Ave NE | Seattle, WA 98125 Phone: (206) 494.0400 between counsel for Defendants and counsel for Valve Corporation, with a date range of December 30, 2024 through January 9, 2025.

- 4. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 28** is a true and correct copy of an email chain between counsel for Defendants and counsel for Valve Corporation, with a date range of February 4, 2025 though February 27, 2025.
- 5. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 29** is a true and correct copy of an email chain between counsel for Defendants and counsel for Valve Corporation, with a date range of March 11, 2025 through March 19, 2025.
- 6. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 30** is a true and correct copy of a Subpoena to Produce Documents, Information, or Objects or to Permit Inspection of Premises in a Civil Action issued by Valve Corporation to Kizzia Johnson PLLC, dated December 19, 2024.
- 7. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 31** is a true and correct copy of an email chain between counsel for Defendants and counsel for Valve Corporation, with a date range of December 30, 2024 through January 8, 2025.
- 8. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 32** is a true and correct copy of an email chain between counsel for Defendants and counsel for Valve Corporation, with a date range of February 12, 2025 through February 17, 2025.
- 9. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 33** is a true and correct copy of excerpts from Defendant Patent Asset Management, LLC's Objections and Responses to Plaintiff's First Set of Requests for Production.
- 10. To date, the Rothschild Defendants have produced over 4,000 documents, of which over 3,750 were produced by the Rothschild Defendants (including public filings). The Defendants have made the following productions:

26

27

28

12055 15th Ave NE | Seattle, WA 98125 Phone: (206) 494.0400

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	

Date of Production	Number of	Bates Numbers	Custodians
	Documents		
2/12/2025	481	ROTHSCHILD1-6513	Meyler Legal PLLC; Public
2/17/2025	1128	ROTHSCHILD6514-15434	Public
2/25/2025	561	ROTHSCHILD15435-	Daniel Falcucci ²
		18436	
2/27/2025	1753	ROTHSCHILD18437-	Public
		29445	
3/07/2025	46	ROTHSCHILD29446-	Daniel Falcucci
		30193	
3/19/2025	27	ROTHSCHILD30194-	Daniel Falcucci
		30620	
3/24/2025	120	ROTHSCHILD30621-	Meyler Legal PLLC; Daniel Falcucci;
		31682	Leigh Rothschild; Christina Arias; and Public

These productions include public filings of patent lawsuits brought by Defendants Display Technologies, LLC and Rothschild Broadcast Distribution Systems, LLC involving the asserted patents; communications between Mr. Meyler and opposing counsel; communications between Mr. Meyler and counsel for Valve Corporation; patent assignments; settlement and license agreements; management agreements of Defendants Display Technologies, LLC and Rothschild Broadcast Distribution Systems, LLC; and operations agreements of Defendants Display Technologies, LLC; Rothschild Broadcast Distribution Systems, LLC; and Patent Asset Management, LLC.

The Rothschild Defendants' March 7, 2025 production included approximately 11.

25

26

19

20

21

22

23

24

Phone: (206) 494.0400

² While Mr. Falcucci is identified as the custodian of these documents, this set of documents is public documents.

²⁷ MCPHAIL DECLARATION IN OPPOSITION TO VALVE CORPORATION'S MOTION TO COMPEL Case No. 2:23-cv-01016 Page 3 of 4

1	40 agreements.
2	12. 1
3	During that med
4	explained that t
5 6	agreement on se
6	collection of ES
7	and that the Ro
8	
9	I declare
10	that the foregoing
11	
12	Executed on: M
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	

12. I attended a meet and confer with counsel for Valve in late October of 2024.
During that meet and confer, the parties discussed Defendants' collection of ESI, and I
explained that the Defendants collection of ESI would be done when the parties had reached
agreement on search terms and that Defendants would not be engaging in the piecemeal
collection of ESI. I also noted that the nature of the case was likely to implicate privilege issue
and that the Rothschild Defendants may need to produce privileged documents.

I declare under the penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge.

Executed on: March 24, 2025 By: <u>/s/ Donald R. McPhail</u>
Donald R. McPhail

MCPHAIL DECLARATION IN OPPOSITION TO VALVE CORPORATION'S MOTION TO COMPEL Case No. 2:23-cv-01016

Page 4 of 4

24

25

26

27

28

DC LAW GROUP

12055 15th Ave NE | Seattle, WA 98125 Phone: (206) 494.0400